

January 19, 2016

The Honorable Mitch McConnell  
Majority Leader  
United States Senate  
Washington, D.C. 20510

The Honorable Harry Reid  
Democratic Leader  
United States Senate  
Washington, D.C. 20510

**Re: S. 2123, the Sentencing Reform and Corrections Act of 2015**

Dear Leaders McConnell and Reid:

As you consider bringing S. 2123 to the Senate floor, we write in response to a recent letter—dated December 10, 2015—that was addressed to you and signed by 40 former federal law enforcement officials expressing their concerns with this legislation. We feel the need to contribute to a thoughtful analysis of key provisions their letter neglected to mention, which are vital to your deliberation.

We, the undersigned, are former federal prosecutors and senior government officials who have served on the front lines of our criminal justice system. Our purpose is to focus the discussion on the substance of the bill's proposed improvements to federal sentencing and corrections policies. Otherwise, good policy reforms could easily fall victim to politics and fear.

First, we thank the 40 signers of the December 10 letter. We agree with almost all of what they stated about our system of justice because we all have one thing in common: at one time or another we all served as senior Department of Justice officials, United States Attorneys, Assistant United States Attorneys, or other government officials including judges. We all deeply believe in notions of fairness in the administration of justice, and many of us pursued successful prosecutions and argued for appropriate and substantial punishments in federal courts.

Further, many of the signers—going back approximately 30 years—were architects of the current sentencing regime that aimed to strike the right balance between all interests and did contribute to a dramatic reduction in crime and historic lows for violent crime. They successfully protected the public and deserve to be acknowledged and validated for their service.

Second, S. 2123 will only improve on their work—by amending just a few sentencing policies that produced unintended consequences and created imbalance in the scales of justice. The bill is the result of a very thoughtful analysis of these deficiencies that was informed by at least one former Attorney General and a handful of former U.S. Attorneys and Assistant U.S. Attorneys. It makes modest, reasonable changes to the sentencing regime they put in place, including:

- It not only preserves the 5 and 10-year mandatory minimum sentences for drug offenders, but more effectively targets them to high-level drug traffickers by providing a more accurate focus on the role of the drug offender instead of drug quantity alone, and increases a judge's ability to utilize limited discretion when determining appropriate sentences. This is the only way to more effectively tie the longer mandatory minimum sentences to high-level drug traffickers and violent criminals.

- It helps to preserve the ability of federal prosecutors to use the Armed Career Criminal Act as a tool in the face of a recent series of Supreme Court decisions that struck down many of its provisions.
- It preserves the stacking of firearms offenses but avoids the Weldon Angelos-type “outlier” problems that cause malfunctions of the system and other unintended consequences.

Third, S. 2123 actually gives federal prosecutors new tools to target violent criminals with enhanced penalties, including:

- It increases the scope of mandatory minimum sentences to include a larger percentage of federal offenders, and expands enhanced penalties to offenders with prior serious violent felony convictions so federal prosecutors can use the drug laws to target serious violent felons.
- It extends the reach of the stacking of firearms provision to include firearms offenders with similar prior state-level convictions so prosecutors can use the gun laws to target serious violent state felons.
- It raises the statutory maximum for unlawful possession of firearms.

Finally, the Corrections Act—Title II of S. 2123—will give the Department of Justice and Bureau of Prisons new tools to reduce recidivism, which will only increase public safety, including:

- It puts a new focus on rehabilitation and correction, and establishes risk and needs assessment as the cornerstone of more effective recidivism reduction programming, and a more efficient federal prison system.
- The bill will incentivize prisoners to not only participate in programs and jobs, but to actually reduce their risk of recidivism. In fact, it will effectively transform the federal prison system from risk management to risk reduction.
- Its risk reassessment provision is vital. We need to identify dynamic risk factors and indicators of real change in thinking and behavior, make prisoners demonstrate this change, and measure it over time with a standard, objective instrument as they complete their programs. This will be a major advancement for the federal system.
- Through these risk reassessments, higher-risk prisoners will have to demonstrate substantial risk reduction to progress down into lower risk categories and become eligible to utilize their earned time credits.
- And lower-risk prisoners will be eligible to spend up to 25% of their sentences in home confinement and community supervision, which will produce significant savings. This is remarkable as the most current cost of post-conviction supervision is \$3,909 per year, as opposed to \$30,621 per year for imprisonment, and \$28,999 for residential reentry centers. This is a much more cost-effective way to supervise lower-risk offenders.

In conclusion, we endorse this bill because it makes some of the most needed improvements to the front and back ends of the federal criminal justice system. And it is important to note that applying these reforms retroactively will not eliminate all mandatory minimum sentences these offenders are subject to, or any additional penalties the judges previously imposed. A drug dealer using a gun will still be subject to a significant mandatory minimum sentence for use of the firearm plus additional time for the underlying drug offense. And since the Department of Justice has committed to a case-by-case review to ensure that any resentencing is done carefully and with complete transparency, offenders who pose a threat to public safety will not be released early.

As FBI Director James Comey recently noted before the Senate Judiciary Committee, when asked about S. 2123:

*As you know, we don't take positions on legislation, but because I spent my career as a prosecutor, it's an area of interest of mine. I actually read the bill and my reaction was it's reasonable, the things that are discussed in there are reasonable. I have found mandatory minimums... to be an important part of making some of the most important cases I was involved with. But I think that the reform as I understand it seems reasonable to me.*

...

*Given the recidivism rate, which is one of the things that's exciting about the legislation Senator Grassley talked about, trying to get us doing a better job of reducing recidivism...*

We urge Congress to pass this legislation because it is good for federal law enforcement and public safety. It will more effectively ensure that justice shall be done. Thank you for your consideration.

Respectfully yours,

Michael B. Mukasey  
Former United States Attorney General  
Former Chief United States District Court Judge, Southern District of New York  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

Larry D. Thompson  
Former United States Deputy Attorney General  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Georgia

Charles B. Renfrew  
Former United States Deputy Attorney General  
Former United States District Court Judge, Northern District of California

David W. Ogden  
Former United States Deputy Attorney General  
Former Assistant Attorney General for the Civil Division, United States Department of Justice

William S. Sessions  
Former Director of the Federal Bureau of Investigation  
Former United States Attorney, Western District of Texas  
Former Chief United States District Court Judge, Western District of Texas

Louis J. Freeh

Former Director of the Federal Bureau of Investigation  
Former United States District Court Judge, Southern District of New York  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

Paul Cassell

Former Federal District Court Judge, District of Utah  
Former Associate Deputy Attorney General, United States Department of Justice  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Utah

Bob Barr

Former Member of Congress (R-GA)  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Georgia  
Former Anti-Drug Coordinator for the United States Department of Justice, Southeastern United States

Brett L. Tolman

Former United States Attorney, District of Utah  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Utah

Matthew D. Orwig

Former United States Attorney, Eastern District of Texas  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Eastern District of Texas

Lourdes G. Baird

Former United States Attorney, Central District of California  
Former United States District Court Judge, Central District of California  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Central District of California

James S. Brady

Former United States Attorney, Western District of Michigan

J.R. Brooks

Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Alabama

Ben Burgess

Former United States Attorney, District of Kansas  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Kansas

James C. Cissell

Former United States Attorney, Southern District of Ohio

Robert J. Cleary

Former United States Attorney, Southern District of Illinois  
Former United States Attorney, District of New Jersey  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of New Jersey  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

W.J. Michael Cody  
Former United States Attorney, Western District of Tennessee

Richard Cullen  
Former United States Attorney, Eastern District of Virginia  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

William B. Cummings  
Former United States Attorney, Eastern District of Virginia

Deborah J. Daniels  
Former United States Attorney, Southern District of Indiana  
Former United States Assistant Attorney General

Michael H. Dettmer  
Former United States Attorney, Western District of Michigan

W. Thomas Dillard  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Florida  
Former United States Attorney, Eastern District of Tennessee  
Former United States Magistrate Judge, Eastern District of Tennessee  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Eastern District of Tennessee

Robert B. Fiske Jr.  
Former United States Attorney, Southern District of New York  
Former Chair of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

Ronald T. Knight  
Former United States Attorney, Middle District of Georgia

Greg Lockhart  
Former United States Attorney, Southern District of Ohio  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of Ohio

Salvatore R. Martoche  
Former United States Attorney, Western District of New York  
Former Chair of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Sherry Matteucci  
Former United States Attorney, District of Montana

A. Melvin McDonald  
Former United States Attorney, District of Arizona  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Kenneth J. Mighell  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Texas  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Northern District of Texas

Otto G. Obermaier  
Former United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

Paul Perez  
Former United States Attorney, Middle District of Florida  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Layn R. Phillips  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Oklahoma  
Former United States District Court Judge, Western District of Oklahoma  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Central District of California

Richard J. Pocker  
Former United States Attorney, District of Nevada  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Nevada

George W. Proctor  
Former United States Attorney, Eastern District of Arkansas  
Former Chair of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee  
Former Federal Immigration Judge  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Territory of Guam and the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands

James A. Rolfe  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Texas

Benito Romano  
Former United States Attorney, Southern District of New York  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

Richard B. Roper  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of Texas  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Northern District of Texas

Joseph P. Russoniello  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of California  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Kevin V. Ryan  
Former United States Attorney, Northern District of California

Richard A. Stacy  
Former United States Attorney, District of Wyoming  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Herbert Stern  
Former United States Attorney, District of New Jersey  
Former United States District Court Judge, District of New Jersey

Stanley A. Twardy, Jr.  
Former United States Attorney, District of Connecticut

R.E. Thompson  
Former United States Attorney, District of New Mexico  
Former Chair of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Atlee Wampler III  
Former United States Attorney, Southern District of Florida

Donald W. Washington  
Former United States Attorney, Western District of Louisiana  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee

Francis M. Wikstrom  
Former United States Attorney, District of Utah

William Wilmoth  
Former United States Attorney, District of West Virginia  
Former Member of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of West Virginia

Nathaniel R. Jones  
Former United States Circuit Court Judge, Court of Appeals for the Sixth Circuit

Deanell Tacha  
Former Chief United States Circuit Court Judge, Court of Appeals for the Tenth Circuit

William G. Bassler  
Former United States District Court Judge, District of New Jersey

David H. Coar  
Former United States District Court Judge, Northern District of Illinois

William F. Downes  
Former Chief United States District Court Judge, District of Wyoming

Nancy Gertner  
Former United States District Court Judge, District of Massachusetts

Richard J. Holwell  
Former United States District Court Judge, Southern District of New York

Stephen G. Larson  
Former United States District Court Judge, Central District of California  
Former United States Magistrate Judge, Central District of California  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Central District of California

Frank H. McFadden  
Former United States District Court Judge, Northern District of Alabama

Stephen M. Orlofsky  
Former United States District Court Judge, District of New Jersey  
Former United States Magistrate Judge, District of New Jersey

Fern M. Smith  
Former District Court Judge, Northern District of California

Abraham D. Sofaer  
Former United States District Court Judge, Southern District of New York  
Former Legal Adviser to the United States Department of State  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, Southern District of New York

Alfred M. Wolin  
Former United States District Court Judge, District of New Jersey

Bruce Einhorn  
Former Chief of Litigation, U.S. Department of Justice's Office of Special Investigations (OSI)  
Former Federal Immigration Judge

Sam Alba  
Former United States Magistrate Judge, District of Utah  
Former First Assistant and Chief of the Criminal Division, United States Attorney's Office, District of Utah

Eric Benson  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Utah

Nathan Crane  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Nevada

Brett Parkinson  
Former Assistant United States Attorney, District of Utah

Matthew Lewis  
Former Senior Counsel to the Assistant Attorney General for the Criminal Division, United States Department of Justice

Robert Steinbuch  
Law Professor at University of Arkansas Law School  
Former IRS Attorney